

Institute of  
Peace and  
Conflict Studies  
(IPCS)



## **Nuclear Disarmament & Regional Security** Reintroducing the Disarmament Debate among Young Scholars



**D. Suba Chandran**  
**Rekha Chakravarthi**

**IPCS Workshop Report**  
August 2008



## About the Workshop

### Introduction

A new debate is taking shape globally on the role and relevance of nuclear weapons. This debate is no more based on the Cold War confrontation between the two super powers where deterrence was considered supreme in order to maintain peace and stability between two contending nuclear weapon



powers. In the emerging multipolar world of today the issues are more complex and challenging. It introduces the behaviour of rogue states, the rise of non-state actors, the proliferation of WMDs and clandestine nuclear networks. The nuclear debate has transformed to questions of countering WMD terrorism, nuclear weapons safety and security. India had led this debate in the 1950's and needs to take a leadership position today.

At the global level, a new initiative on nuclear weapons elimination is emerging, led by former officials and strategic experts in the USA. This quartet comprising George P.Shultz, Willam J. Perry, Henry A Kissinger and Sam Nunn are raising the possibility of a world without nuclear weapons. While this is not likely to be possible in the immediate future, an attempt can definitely be made to devise ways and possibilities towards this goal. The Indo-US nuclear deal, has added a new dimension to this in South Asia.

It is important that young scholars understand this changed global environment. Towards meeting this objective, the IPCS is organizing a series of Workshops at national and regional levels, to reintroduce the disarmament debate in South Asia, among young scholars. The first workshop took place in August 2008, in New Delhi. Following this the IPCS organized two workshops in Chennai in September 2008. The participants were selected from the leading colleges and universities from New Delhi and also included interns from colleges in the UK and US. Spread over a period of three days, the workshop, included two documentaries and was led by senior scholars and experts from India

**Maj Gen Dipankar Banerjee**  
**Director, IPCS**

# Nuclear Disarmament & Regional Security

Institute of  
Peace and  
Conflict Studies  
(IPCS)

## In Theory and Practice: Deterrence and Disarmament

Prof. Rajesh Rajagopalan gave the lecture in which the origin of theories related to deterrence and disarmament were discussed. Much of the theorizing was done in the US during the 1940s and 50s, as a result, most of the deterrence theories have been based on American perspectives. Bernard Brodie, defined nuclear weapons as absolute. There was a change in strategy on war; they were no more aimed at winning the wars, but deterring them.

In the 1950 and 60s, another change came into being, in which the nuclear weapons were perceived as just another weapon. During this phase, the military strategy was not only primarily discussed by the military people; numerous civilians starting from Brodie gave excellent inputs into military strategies.

The concept of deterrence expanded, making the difference between conventional and nuclear deterrence clear. At a later stage, there also emerged a difference between deterrence and compellance. Compellance is difficult, while deterrence is easy. There are three major stream of nuclear deterrence: Deterrence by punishment, deterrence by denial and existential deterrence. The lecture ended with a focus on stability-instability paradox.



## Treaties and Organizations

Prof Rajesh Rajagopalan and Amb Arundhati Ghose led the panel discussion on treaties and organizations, in which the role of





NPT, IAEA and NSG were discussed. The discussion focused on the following. The objectives, strategies and functions of the IAEA, issues of safeguards and the new proposal on a fuel bank. The role of NSG was criticized, for countries like Switzerland and Germany breached their own laws and exported nuclear materials to Pakistan. NSG is just not a cartel, but a powerful political cartel. Within this cartel, the most powerful, decide what course should be taken. NSG is the part of US non-proliferation policy.



### **Safety and Security of Nuclear Weapons & WMD Terrorism**

Prof Rajaraman and Dr Ajey Lele led the panel, analyzing threats from the non-State actors and the possibilities of WMD terrorism.

Nuclear Weapons are not easy to make in lab by the non-State actors. However, it may not be difficult for them to acquire nuclear materials. Amongst the various possibilities relating to the use of nuclear, chemical and biological weapons by non-State actors, the threat from dirty bombs assume more importance.

The following could be considered as the rationale for the WMD terrorism: Changed psychology of terrorist organizations; To exploit the classic weapon of terrorism, that is, fear; desire to negotiate from a position of unsurpassed strength; A tool of political blackmail; WMDs offer logistical and psychological advantages; and to cause economic damage.

Osama may be in possession of a tactical nuclear device. But there is nothing called ready to use weapon also delivery platforms. There could be a sabotage at nuclear site - a la Chernobyl effect, or an aerial attack on nuclear installations. However, WMD terrorism using nuclear weapons is a least likely scenario. The real threat comes from a Dirty bomb, using radiological agents like Caesium-137, Iridium-192,

Cobalt-60 are easily available. Some possible radiological attacks could be in the following forms: Bomb blasts during Dasshera festival at five different heavily crowded 'garba' pandals at Ahmedabad; Simultaneous attacks at Vadodara /Surat.

In South Asia, chances of Hoax cases are maximum, taht the actual use. Amongst the WMD weapons, usage of CBR weapons - a possibility. Pakistan is unstable and radical elements less likely to use, accidental blast could be a possibility. In the next five years, terrorists may procure a sub kiloton nuclear device from the existing 'Nuclear Networks'-possible mostly with state help. LTTE may opt for radiological or chemical weapons. And American troops in Afghanistan/Iraq could be targets

### **Nuclear Weapons and Regional Security: India and China**

Dr. Srikanth Kondapalli and Maj. Gen. Dipankar Banerjee led the panel discussion for the session on "Nuclear Weapon and Regional Security: India and China." The session outlined the nuclear policies of China and India and their nuclear postures vis-à-vis each other.

With regard to China, its role in the international non-proliferation regime; its compliance with the International Atomic Energy Agency; its assistance to Pakistan's nuclear weapons programme; its policies towards nuclear-weapon and non-nuclear-weapon states; its nuclear-weapon modernization plans to counter any nuclear-weapon deployment by India; what the Chinese nuclear policy will look like in five years; and its implications for the international community as well as for South Asian security were discussed in detail.



### **Nuclear Weapons and Regional Security: India and Pakistan**



Prof. P R Chari and Dr. Manpreet Sethi lead the panel discussion for the session on "Nuclear Weapon and Regional Security: India and Pakistan."

India's transformation to a nuclear weapon state in 1998; India's nuclear policy and nuclear strategy that is structured to cope with its threat perceptions arising from China and Pakistan; its policy of "no nuclear use" against non-nuclear powers and "no first use" against nuclear adversaries; its nuclear Doctrine which is predicated on assumption that nuclear weapons remain instruments for national and collective security; and its commitment to global nuclear disarmament were discussed.



On the other hand, Pakistan regards its nuclear weapons as the most precious strategic asset which constitutes the ultimate guarantor of its existence. This is reflected in the article "Pakistan's Nuclear Imperatives" written by Gen Mirza Aslam; he says "Oxygen is basic to life, and one does not debate its desirability, nuclear deterrence has assumed that life-saving property for Pakistan." Pakistan's nuclear weapons are wholly and solely India-centric. Nuclear weapons are seen as a means to balance India's conventional superiority. Pakistan also views its nuclear weapons as a deterrent against conventional war with India. Thus, deterrence has been used by Pakistan to neutralize the possibility of an Indian conventional attack even while pursuing revisionist policies itself. Nuclear weapons also provide Pakistan immunity to conduct aggressive proxy war against India.

Politically, nuclear weapons are regarded as reliable guarantee of security and survival in the event of withdrawal of alliance support (from the US or China) and concerns about improving Indo-US and Sino-Indian relations. Pakistan regards its nuclear weapons as a symbol of national pride, scientific modernity and

independence from foreign powers. Zia-ul-Haq propagated the concept of an Islamic Bomb, which meant that its nuclear bomb belonged to the larger Muslim world. Pakistan's policy for first use of nuclear weapons and the possibilities of a breakdown of nuclear deterrence by Pakistan were also discussed.

### **Proliferation, Safety and Security of Nuclear Weapons in Pakistan**

D Suba Chandran and Mr. Prashant Hosur lead the panel discussion for the session on "Proliferation, Safety and Security of Nuclear Weapons in Pakistan." The discussions primarily centered around the emergence of AQ Khan network; its relevance to existing networks, if any and the safety of Pakistan's nuclear arsenals.

There are various threats to Pakistan's nuclear assets, which can be classified into external and internal threats. External threat refers to the possibility of armed individuals or groups (al Qaeda or the Taliban) gaining access to nuclear weapons, components or fissile material. Internal threat refers to the possibility of individuals who work at a facility to remove and transfer fissile material, nuclear weapons, or components to non-state actors. Other possibilities such as nuclear thefts as a result of accidents or during transportation of sensitive items or due to a complete breakdown of the command and control structure will leave the nuclear assets exposed to use by non-state actors. In a worse case scenario, there may be a coup wherein the new regime attempts to gain control of the nuclear weapons. The possibility of the occurrence of all or any of the above is dependent on whether or not Pakistan suffers a complete breakdown of political order.

Pakistan, however, insists on a command and control structure that ensures that any unauthorized or accidental use of nuclear weapons does not take place. 'Command' has to do with the usability of nuclear weapons, and 'control' with the prevention of





their use. The Pakistani military controls the nuclear weapons and the military is widely considered to be the most professional body in Pakistan. Pakistan also keeps different components of its nuclear weapons in different locations and its nuclear weapons are said to be equipped with Permissive Action Links (PALs) that prevent the unauthorized use of a nuclear weapon. Pakistan, therefore, strongly refutes the American fear over the safety of its nuclear assets.



### **Indo-US Nuclear Deal**

Dr. Vidya Shankar Aiyar and Ms. Gretchen Smith lead the panel discussion for the session on "Indo-US Nuclear Deal."

The session examined the highly debated Indo-US nuclear deal, issues concerning the deal and its implications for Indo-US relations. The panelists analyzed the objectives of the Indo-US nuclear deal; responses to the deal in India and the United States; its implications for the global non-proliferation regime; and India-US relations post-nuclear deal.

## Participants

### Faculty

#### **AIYAR, Vidya Shankar**

Dr. Vidya Shankar Aiyar, Executive Editor, IBN World/CNN IBN is one of India's top TV news anchors with a doctorate in International Affairs. He has spent over two decades internationally in radio and television. Shankar is unparalleled in the tough live coverage of international news events, including Gen Musharraf's imposition of emergency in November 2007, and the wars on Iraq and Afghanistan. In 1996, he helped establish the IPCS, where he worked as an analyst in Asian and nuclear security matters.

#### **BANERJEE, Dipankar**

Maj. Gen. Banerjee is the Director of the Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies, New Delhi. He was also the Executive Director of the Regional Centre for Strategic Studies, a South Asian think tank located in Colombo. He has held various operational and planning assignments as a combat officer of the Indian Army followed by research on national and international security issues as the Deputy Director of the Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses, New Delhi.

#### **CHANDRAN, D Suba**

Dr. Suba Chandran is the Deputy Director of the Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies, New Delhi. He has authored several books and articles on South Asian security. He earned his PhD at Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, and his M.Phil and M.A. at Madras Christian College, Chennai. His research interests include Kashmir, Pakistan, Indo-Pak relations, armed conflict, and suicide terrorism.

#### **CHARI, P R**

Professor P R Chari is a Research Professor at the IPCS. He was a former member of the Indian Administrative Service and Director of the Institute of Defence Studies and Analyses, and Research Professor at the Center for Policy Research, New Delhi. He has worked extensively on nuclear disarmament, non-proliferation, and Indian defence issues. He has published over 1200 op-ed articles in newspapers/websites and over 110 monographs and research papers in journals/chapters in books in India and abroad.



## Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies (IPCS)



Joining the Foreign Service in 1963, Ambassador Ghose has served in various countries in different capacities, including on India's delegation to the UN. She served as India's Ambassador to Republic of Korea, Egypt, UNESCO, to the UN offices in Geneva and to the conference on Disarmament. Ambassador Ghose retired in 1977, and was nominated to the Union Public Service Commission in 1998 serving till 2004. Ambassador Ghose has contributed numerous articles and chapters in books, particularly on WMD and Arms control issues.



### **HOSUR, Prashant**

Mr. Prashant Hosur is a Masters candidate at the John C. Whitehead School of Diplomacy and International Relations, Seton Hall University, NJ, USA. His research focuses on nuclear issues, politics of economic statecraft, energy security, and US foreign policy in South Asia. His recent publications include "Pakistan's Nuclear Assets: How Safe are the Weapons of Deterrence?" IPCS Issue Brief, June 2008, "Q&A: AQ Khan's Proliferation Network Resurfaces," IPCS Article, June 2008, "AQ Khan: Nuclear Politics," IPCS Article, July 2008.

### **KONDAPALLI, Srikanth**

Dr. Srikanth Kondapalli is Professor in Chinese Studies at Jawaharlal Nehru University. He is also an Honorary Fellow at Institute of Chinese Studies, Delhi and Research Associate at Centre for Chinese Studies, University of Stellenbosch, South Africa. He served at IDSA for nearly 12 years. He was a Visiting Professor at National Chengchi University, Taipei in 2004 and a Visiting Fellow at China Institute of Contemporary International Relations, Beijing in May 2007. He has published two books, two monographs, and several articles national and international journals and newspapers. He has lectured at Indian academic, defence, and media establishments.

### **LELE, Ajey**

Wing Commander Ajey Lele is an Indian Air Force Officer and is currently working as a Research Fellow at the Institute of Defence Studies and Analyses, New Delhi. He specializes on issues related to Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMD) and Space Technologies. He is a postgraduate in Physics from Pune University. He has also done M.Sc And M.Phil in Defence and Strategic Studies from the University of Madras. He has published many articles in journals, websites and newspapers. He has authored two books title "Bio-Weapons: The Genie in the Bottle," and "Weather and Warfare."

### **RAJARAMAN, R**

Professor R Rajaraman is Emeritus Professor of theoretical physics at Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi. He obtained his PhD from Cornell University in 1963 under the supervision of Nobel laureate Prof. Hans Bethe. Over four decades, he has taught and done research in physics at, among other places, Cornell University, MIT, Stanford University, Delhi University, IISc Bangalore and JNU. He is co-chair and founding member of the International Panel on Fissile Materials. He has been writing on nuclear weapon and nuclear energy issues in India for over 35 years. He has analysed the Indo-US Nuclear Agreement in detail and has been clarifying its implications to the public in numerous articles and public lectures over the past two years.

### **RAJAGOPALAN, Rajesh**

Dr. Rajesh Rajagalan is an associate professor at the School of International Studies, JNU. He has a PhD from the City University of New York (1998). Previously, he was a Senior Fellow at the Observer Research Foundation, New Delhi and Research Fellow at the Institute of Defence Studies and Analyses, New Delhi. He also served as the Deputy Secretary in the National Security Council Secretariat, Government of India (2000-2001). His areas of research interests include international relations theory, military doctrines, and nuclear weapons and disarmament. His book, "Second Strike: Arguments about Nuclear War in South Asia," was published by Penguin (India) in 2005.

### **SETHI, Manpreet**

Dr. Manpreet Sethi is Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Air Power Studies, New Delhi where she is engaged in a research project on India's Nuclear Strategy. She received her PhD from Latin American Division of the School of International Studies, JNU, New Delhi in 1997 and thereafter served on the research faculty of IDSA, New Delhi where she conducted research on issues related to nuclear proliferation and disarmament. As Senior Fellow at Centre for Strategic and International Studies from 2002-2006, she undertook projects on "Nuclear Energy for India's Energy Security". She is author of the books Argentina's Nuclear Policy (1999) and co-author of Nuclear Deterrence and Diplomacy (2004).

### **SMITH, Gretchen**

Ms. Gretchen Smith is a Masters candidate at the University of Denver and has recently completed an internship at the Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies, New Delhi. Her research focuses on non-proliferation, nuclear weapons in South Asia and economic security. Her recent publications include "India-Specific Safeguards Agreement: Indian and American Responses," Mainstream, July 2008 (co-authored), "Its not as smooth as 1,2,3...." Daily Pioneer, July 2008 (co-





authored), "India's Role in the Global Disarmament Debate," IPCS Article, July 2008, "Q&A: India-Specific Safeguards Agreement," IPCS Article, July 2008 (co-authored).

## PARTICIPANTS

**AHMED, Ali** is a former Colonel in the Indian Army and is presently a Research Fellow at IDSA and works on defence doctrines. He is a PhD scholar at CIPOD, JNU, New Delhi. He also



holds a M.Phil in international relations from Cambridge University. His areas of interest include nuclear doctrine, south Asia, Kashmir, defence doctrine and internal security.

**AHMED, Iqbal** is pursuing M.A. in French, JNU, New Delhi with specialization in translation and interpretation. His research interests include the United Nations and European Union.

**ANAL, Daryal Rocko** is a PhD scholar at CIPOD, JNU. His areas of interest include international terrorism, international security issues, UN, human rights, nuclear non-proliferation, and

weapons of mass destruction.

**BARMAN, Deep Jyoti** is an M.Phil scholar at CIPOD, JNU. Her areas of interest include theories of nuclear deterrence and strategies of nuclear warfare.

**CHAKRABORTY, Papri** is an M.Phil scholar at the South Asian Studies Division, JNU. Her area of interest is South Asian security dynamics.

**DAS, Madhumita** is a Masters candidate at Nelson Mandela Centre for Peace and Conflict Resolution, Jamia Millia Islamia, New Delhi. Her areas of interest include international relations theory, non-traditional security, ethno politics and political economy.

**ISHIDA, Yasuyuki** is a Research Scholar at CIPOD, JNU. Her areas of interests include, peace and security studies; international theory; nuclear non-proliferation, arms control, and disarmament. Her recent publications include "US Policy towards Asia-Pacific after the Cold War" [in Japanese], (Tokyo: Keio university, 1998).

**JEGANAATHAN, J** is a PhD Scholar at the Centre for European Studies at JNU. His areas of interest include nuclear proliferation, nuclear terrorism, nuclear deterrence, European security and nuclear diplomacy.

**KAZI, Reshmi** is an Associate Fellow at the IDSA, New Delhi. Her research interests include India's nuclear weapons policy and issues relating to disarmament, WMD proliferation studies and other WMDs like 'Robust Nuclear Earth Penetrator' and 'Dirty Bombs.' Her forthcoming book titled "The Process of Negotiation of the Nuclear Deal/123 Agreement (India)" is being published by Routledge Publications.

**MISHRA, Rohit Kumar** is a PhD scholar at the School of International Studies, JNU. His areas of interest include Asia-Pacific Politics, Russian Security and Foreign Policy and Nuclear Disarmament and Arms Control.

**MISHRA, Sitakanta** is a Senior Research Scholar in South Asian Studies Division, JNU. His area of interest and research include nuclear terrorism, non-proliferation & disarmament, India's nuclear and foreign policy, and South Asian affairs. He has authored the book "The Challenge of Nuclear Terror" (Knowledge World, 2008).

**NAKANISHI, Hiroaki** is a Masters candidate at Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi.

**PRAKASH, P** is a M.Phil scholar at the Centre of East Asia Studies, JNU. His areas of interest include WMD proliferation and disarmament, ballistic missile defense in East Asia and maritime security.

**RAHMAN, Mirza Zulfiquir** is a M.Phil scholar at the Diplomacy and Disarmament Division at CIPOD, JNU. His research focuses on international regimes of disarmament and India's position and policy in the global disarmament dialogue and process. His recent publications include "Tension in the Rolling Hills: Burmese Population and Border Trade in Mizoram," IPCS Research Paper 14, April 2008.



**RAMANA, Siddharth** is a Researcher with the British American Security Information Council (BASIC), UK. He is working with BASIC on their "Getting to Zero" program, which envisions global nuclear disarmament. He is currently pursuing an M.A in Peace and Conflict Studies from



## Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies (IPCS)



Malmo Hogskola, Sweden and has completed M.Sc. (Econ) in Intelligence and Strategic Studies from the University of Aberystwyth, Wales.

**RASTOGI, Devna** has completed Masters in International Studies from the Department of International Studies, Stella Maris College, Chennai. Her areas of research interest include India-Pakistan relations, nuclear issues and human rights.



**SHUKLA, Vidisha** is a M.Phil scholar at JNU. His areas of interest include nuclear issues, security and foreign policy. He has presented many seminar papers at the Banaras Hindu University.

**TIWARI, Nishikant** is a Research Scholar at the School of International Studies, JNU. His research focuses on security studies, international relations theory and asymmetric warfare, which is also the subject of his PhD thesis, "Coercion, Deterrence and Air Power in Asymmetric Warfare: A case study of Israel and Sri Lanka." His recent publications include, "Terrorism and Nuclear Deterrence Theory, Aakrosh, July 2007.

**VIKRAM, Vijay** is a Research Intern at the IPCS. His research focuses on India-China relations. He is currently pursuing a degree in International Relations at the University of St Andrews, UK.